

RMS 2928155

IMPEACHMENT

WHAT EVERYONE NEEDS TO KNOW®

MICHAEL J. GERHARDT

MILV 169313

Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche Biblioteca	
Inv.	DSP 7243
Coll.	POST. 45R.B. 88

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	XV
Introduction	1
1. The Basic Terms	6
<i>What does the term "impeachment" mean?</i>	6
<i>What does the Constitution explicitly say about the impeachment process?</i>	7
<i>What does the Constitution implicitly say about impeachment?</i>	8
<i>What are the emoluments clauses?</i>	10
<i>What are the origins of impeachment?</i>	11
<i>What were the specific controversies regarding official misconduct that the Constitutional Convention addressed?</i>	12
<i>What were the plans that the framers debated before settling on the version of the impeachment process set forth in the Constitution?</i>	13
<i>What happened next?</i>	14
<i>What do the basic terms in the impeachment clauses mean?</i>	18
<i>Is impeachment a legal or political issue?</i>	20
<i>How useful is impeachment?</i>	22
<i>Is impeachment the only mechanism for addressing the serious misconduct of the president, the vice president, and other officials subject to impeachment?</i>	22

2. The History of the Federal Impeachment Process	24
<i>How many people have been impeached, and why?</i>	24
<i>How many of the nineteen people whom the House impeached did the Senate convict and remove from office?</i>	25
<i>How many times has the Senate imposed the sanction of disqualification?</i>	26
<i>What exactly is disqualification?</i>	26
<i>How many officials has the Senate acquitted or found not guilty and therefore not convicted and removed from office?</i>	26
<i>How many officials were impeached but avoided conviction and removal because they resigned from office before their impeachment trials commenced?</i>	26
<i>Were there any other officials who were impeached but somehow avoided having the Senate hold an impeachment trial or convict them for impeachable misconduct?</i>	28
<i>Was Andrew Johnson the first president to be threatened with impeachment?</i>	29
<i>How many presidents have been impeached?</i>	31
<i>Why was Andrew Johnson impeached?</i>	31
<i>Why didn't the Senate convict Andrew Johnson and remove him from office?</i>	32
<i>Would Richard Nixon have been impeached had he not resigned?</i>	34
<i>Why was Bill Clinton impeached?</i>	34
<i>Why did the Senate not convict President Clinton?</i>	36
<i>Why wasn't George W. Bush impeached?</i>	38
<i>Why wasn't Barack Obama impeached?</i>	39
3. Which Federal Officials Are Impeachable	41
<i>Who is subject to impeachment?</i>	41
<i>Are members of Congress subject to impeachment?</i>	42
<i>For purposes of impeachment, to whom does the phrase "all civil officers of the United States" refer?</i>	43
<i>If there is not universal consensus on the meaning of "all civil officers of the United States," who disagrees with that interpretation of the Constitution and why?</i>	45
<i>So, who is right about the meaning of "all civil officers of the United States"?</i>	47

<i>Are Article III judges subject to impeachment?</i>	52
<i>To what extent are officials subject to impeachment for misconduct before their election or appointment to impeachable offices?</i>	55
<i>To what extent are officials subject to impeachment for misconduct after they have left office?</i>	57
4. Defining Impeachable Offenses	59
<i>What do the study of the origins of the Constitution and our experiences with impeachment teach us about the meaning of the terms "other high crimes or misdemeanors"?</i>	59
<i>In impeachment proceedings, how have the members of Congress understood the meaning of "other high crimes and misdemeanors"?</i>	62
<i>Is the Congress bound by its prior practices or could it deviate from, or even abandon, those practices in the future?</i>	64
<i>Must an impeachable offense have a connection to an official's office or duties?</i>	65
<i>May someone be impeached for gross incompetence?</i>	67
<i>So, how are we supposed to determine what qualifies as "serious offenses" against the Republic or breaches of the public trust?</i>	69
<i>What is an example of an abuse of power that is impeachable?</i>	70
<i>Who is Joe Isenberg, and why do his writings come up in some discussions of the scope of impeachable offenses?</i>	70
5. Explaining the Procedures in Impeachment	73
<i>How does an impeachment begin?</i>	73
<i>What is the House's role?</i>	74
<i>Does the House have a constitutional obligation to do any fact-finding?</i>	76
<i>What is the Senate's role in the impeachment process?</i>	78
<i>What does it mean for the Senate to have the power "to try an impeachment?" Must it hold an actual trial for the impeached official?</i>	79
<i>Is it possible to appeal an impeachment conviction to the Supreme Court?</i>	83
<i>What role does the chief justice of the United States have in the impeachment process?</i>	85
<i>What if the chief justice himself is the subject of an impeachment process?</i>	86

<i>Who presides over a vice president's impeachment trial, given that the Constitution makes the vice president the presiding officer of the Senate?</i>	87
<i>What difference, if any, does the Fifth Amendment make to impeachment proceedings?</i>	87
<i>Is there a burden of proof required in impeachment proceedings?</i>	90
<i>Are any rules of evidence required in impeachment proceedings?</i>	91
<i>Does double jeopardy apply to an impeachment?</i>	91
<i>May an impeachment come before civil or criminal proceedings?</i>	92
<i>Have any courts addressed the question of whether impeachment may precede or must follow a criminal indictment?</i>	94
<i>What about high-ranking executive branch officials other than the president? Are they immune to criminal prosecution while they are in office?</i>	98
<i>Is it permissible for a sitting president to be subject to civil lawsuits for damages, or to be criminally indicted and prosecuted? Or must a president be impeached and removed from office beforehand?</i>	100
<i>Does a prior conviction or judgment from a court carry any weight in an impeachment proceeding?</i>	102
<i>Do any special privileges apply in impeachment proceedings?</i>	103
<i>Are there any other privileges that might apply in impeachment proceedings?</i>	105
<i>Does the pardon power extend to impeachment proceedings?</i>	106
6. Explaining What Punishments the Senate May Impose	107
<i>What punishments may be imposed in an impeachment proceeding?</i>	107
<i>What happens when the Senate acquits someone?</i>	107
<i>What happens when someone is convicted?</i>	108
<i>What is disqualification?</i>	109
<i>Does the Constitution require that the sanctions of removal and disqualification be imposed at the same time, or may (or must) they be imposed separately?</i>	109
<i>How many times has the Senate disqualified an official it convicted?</i>	110
<i>Why is disqualification rarely imposed?</i>	111
<i>Does disqualification require at least two-thirds approval in the Senate, as removal does, or may it be done by a majority vote?</i>	111

<i>Who is Alcee Hastings and why is he relevant?</i>	112
<i>What is censure?</i>	113
<i>Is presidential censure constitutional?</i>	114
<i>What is a bill of attainder?</i>	116
<i>Is censure a bill of attainder?</i>	116
<i>Is it permissible for the Senate to issue or approve findings of fact?</i>	116
<i>Are there any other sanctions falling short of removal and disqualification that Congress may impose on public officials for their misconduct in office?</i>	118
<i>What about the Bribery Act of 1790? Is that relevant, and was it constitutional?</i>	119
<i>Are there any other alternatives to impeachment worth knowing about?</i>	124
7. Impeachment in the States and around the World	125
<i>What were the models for the federal impeachment process?</i>	125
<i>How common is impeachment in the states?</i>	125
<i>What are some examples of the different grounds that states provide as the bases for impeachment?</i>	128
<i>Do states use other or additional means than impeachment for addressing the misconduct of public officials?</i>	129
<i>Have there been any impeachments in states that are of particular significance?</i>	130
<i>Have there been any notable impeachment attempts in the states that failed?</i>	132
<i>What are some notable instances of states' using mechanisms other than impeachment to address officials' misconduct?</i>	135
<i>How popular is the impeachment process around the world?</i>	140
<i>What world leaders outside of the United States have been impeached in recent history?</i>	141
<i>Have there been notable failed impeachment attempts outside of the United States in recent history?</i>	143
8. Will Donald Trump Be Impeached?	145
<i>Will Donald Trump be impeached?</i>	145
<i>What are the most serious charges made against the president?</i>	146

<i>How many lawsuits were filed against Donald Trump prior to his election as president?</i>	148
<i>What is the relevance of any of the lawsuits pending against the president at the time of his inauguration or filed against him since then?</i>	149
<i>Which constitutional clauses pertaining to emoluments might have relevance to the question whether President Trump has possibly committed any impeachable offense?</i>	150
<i>Would violating either the foreign emoluments or the compensation clause be an impeachable offense?</i>	151
<i>What if the payment, gift, or benefit given to the president came from a source other than a foreign power?</i>	153
<i>Is it a problem that the president has never disclosed his tax returns or the sources of his income and the degree of his indebtedness?</i>	155
<i>How do we know where to draw the line on what is impeachable or what is not when it comes to a president's receipt of foreign or other financial gifts?</i>	157
<i>What about Hillary Clinton's emails? Didn't she break the law, and should she face criminal liability and perhaps impeachment because of her misconduct?</i>	157
<i>President Trump's lawyer has said that the president is immune in the civil cases that have been filed against him. Is the president's lawyer right?</i>	159
<i>What is collusion?</i>	160
<i>Why do people keep talking about "collusion" if the term has no meaning in the law?</i>	160
<i>Who is Robert Mueller, and what is his role in investigating President Trump?</i>	160
<i>If Mueller is not looking at collusion, what exactly is he investigating?</i>	161
<i>Who is James Comey, and why is he relevant to Mueller's investigation?</i>	161
<i>Are any of the things Mueller is investigating impeachable offenses?</i>	163
<i>Does the president have the power to fire the special counsel, Robert Mueller?</i>	164
<i>Richard Nixon fired the special prosecutor who was investigating Watergate, Archibald Cox. Why wasn't he impeached for that?</i>	165
<i>Is firing the special counsel an impeachable offense?</i>	166
<i>President Trump's lawyer has said the president cannot obstruct justice. Is he right?</i>	168
<i>Why is sexual harassment an impeachable offense?</i>	171

<i>Could President Trump be impeached for doing any of the things he claimed in an Access Hollywood interview that was aired during the presidential campaign?</i>	172
<i>How is the case of Alex Kozinski relevant to our understanding of whether sexual harassment may constitute an impeachable offense?</i>	174
<i>Would Kozinski's misconduct have been a legitimate basis for impeachment?</i>	175
<i>How might the Kozinski case help us better understand impeachment?</i>	176
<i>May the president use his pardon power to stop the Congress from attempting to impeach him or anyone else close to him?</i>	176
<i>Was President Trump's pardon of Sheriff Joe an abuse of power?</i>	177
<i>May the president pardon himself and, if he does, is that an abuse of power and therefore an impeachable offense?</i>	178
<i>What if members of Congress and the public cannot agree on the severity of the misconduct or the damage that the misconduct caused?</i>	180
<i>What are norms, and why are they relevant to this discussion?</i>	181
<i>If President Trump is incompetent, may he be impeached for that?</i>	182
<i>How does the Twenty-fifth Amendment work?</i>	184
<i>Could President Trump have a problem with the Twenty-fifth Amendment?</i>	185
<i>Would it be wrong to take into account the fact that Mike Pence would become president if President Trump were either removed or resigned from office?</i>	188
<i>Are the president's tweets in any way impeachable offenses?</i>	188
<i>What about —?</i>	192
Conclusion	196
APPENDIX: TABLE OF US IMPEACHMENTS	201
NOTES	205
BIBLIOGRAPHY	243
INDEX	245