

# Parliamentary Oversight of the Executives

*Tools and Procedures in Europe*

Elena Griglio

Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche Biblioteca	
Inv.	DSP 7860
Coll.	Cost. 44 R. e. 190

• HART •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

## PART I CONSTITUTIONAL FEATURES OF PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT IN EUROPE

1.	Introduction: Oversight of the Executives. A European Approach .....	3
I.	What Parliamentary Oversight Serves: In Search of a Definition .....	3
II.	Placing the Oversight Function in the European Constitutional Legal Order.....	8
III.	A Selective Approach to Parliamentary Oversight.....	12
IV.	The Fortune of the Oversight Function in Scholarship .....	16
2.	Oversight as a Relational Function Linking Parliaments to Executives .....	23
I.	At the Origins of Parliamentarism in Europe .....	23
II.	Oversight or Scrutiny? A Comparison with Presidential Experiences.....	30
III.	Oversight in Contemporary European Forms of Government .....	34
IV.	The Influence of the Executive-Parties Dimension .....	38
V.	Oversight Serving the Requirements of Executive Accountability .....	45
A.	The Connection with Political Accountability.....	46
B.	Parliamentary Oversight of Public Administration .....	49
VI.	The Problem of Enforcement: Comparing Hard and Soft Oversight .....	53
3.	Instances of Parliamentary Oversight: In Dialogue with Other Parliamentary Functions.....	56
I.	Parliamentary Appraisal of Executive Appointments in Government Formation: Oversight or Elective Function?.....	57
II.	Ex Ante Parliamentary Oversight: Setting the Political Direction.....	61
A.	The Purpose of Ex Ante Oversight .....	62
B.	The Sphere of the <i>Indirizzo Politico</i> .....	64
III.	The Ex Post Dimension of Parliamentary Oversight: Post-Legislative Scrutiny and the Evaluation of Public Policies .....	67
A.	Oversight, Post-Legislative Scrutiny and Evaluation .....	68
B.	Comparing Parliaments' Approaches to Post-Legislative Scrutiny .....	71
IV.	Oversight Through Parliamentary Information: Publicity and Communication.....	74
4.	Classifying Oversight Tools According to Parliamentary Practice .....	80
I.	Pairing Oversight Tools and Procedures According to Parliamentary Practice.....	82

II.	Oversight: A Realm for the Plenary or for Parliamentary Committees?.....	86
A.	Systemic Oversight of Ministerial Policies: Continental Europe and Westminster Committee Systems .....	89
B.	Ad Hoc Oversight Committees.....	91
III.	Informative Tools Instrumental to Oversight .....	96
A.	The 'Political' Tools: The Informative Role of Government and Parliamentary Committees .....	97
B.	The 'Technical' Tools: The Role of External Bodies and Parliamentary Administrations.....	100
IV.	Oversight Tools Preceding Government Action .....	104
A.	Debates .....	105
B.	Motions and Resolutions .....	107
C.	Other Ex Ante Oversight Procedures: The Advisory and 'Participatory' Capacity of Parliaments.....	111
V.	Questioning the Government: A Hybrid Oversight Tool.....	116
A.	Questioning and its Multiple Shapes in Parliamentary Regimes.....	116
B.	Questions and Interpellations: Different Procedures with a Common Purpose?.....	119
VI.	Oversight Tools Following Government Action.....	124
A.	Inquiry Committees.....	125
B.	Select Committees.....	129
5.	Parliamentary Oversight in Bicameral Systems: What Role for Upper Houses?.....	133
I.	Oversight in Symmetric Bicameralism: The Informal Search for Influence by the Italian Senate.....	134
II.	When Asymmetric Bicameralism Does Not Hinder the Influence Capacity of the Upper House: Oversight by the House of Lords .....	140
III.	Oversight as a Means of (Administrative) Territorial Influence in the German Bundesrat.....	144
IV.	Explaining National Variations in Upper Houses' Parliamentary Oversight.....	148

PART II  
INSTANCES OF PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT  
IN SECTORIAL POLICY FIELDS

6.	Parliaments in International Affairs: Fostering Democracy Through the Oversight of Government Action .....	153
I.	Introduction. The Role of Parliaments in International Affairs: Overcoming the Idea of 'Executive Dominance' .....	153
II.	How Parliaments Oversee Government Foreign Policy at the Domestic Level: A Comparative Overview .....	155
A.	Ex Ante Oversight of Foreign Policy .....	156
B.	Parliaments in Treaty-Making: Ex Ante and Ex Post Oversight.....	159
C.	Oversight of Foreign Affairs Through Information.....	165

III.	Political Versus Judicial Interpretation of the Executive–Legislative Balance of Powers in International Affairs.....	168
A.	Political Interpretation .....	169
B.	Judicial Interpretation .....	172
C.	The Miller Case as an Instance of Non-Interpretive Judicial Review.....	175
IV.	The Non-Binding Potential of Parliamentary Oversight in International Affairs .....	179
7.	Parliamentary Oversight in the EU Constitutional Dimension: The Polycentric Paradigm .....	182
I.	Parliamentary Oversight of the EU ‘Fragmented’ Executive .....	182
II.	The Oversight Module Centred on the European Parliament .....	184
A.	The Confidence-Type Oversight Modules: The Relationship with the Commission.....	184
B.	The Non-Confidence Type and Regulatory Oversight Modules .....	188
III.	Indirect Oversight by National Parliaments and National Forms of Government.....	191
IV.	Filling the Gaps of Parliamentary Oversight Through Interparliamentary Cooperation.....	196
V.	The Hybridisation of Parliamentary Oversight in the EU.....	200
8.	Parliamentary Oversight of Budget: A Trade-Off with Budgetary Decision-Making?.....	202
I.	How Parliaments Relate to Budgeting.....	202
II.	Parliamentary Oversight of Budget: Alternative Models.....	203
A.	The Westminster Model for the Ex Post Oversight of Budget .....	204
B.	The French Model: In between Ex Ante and Ex Post Oversight of Budget .....	206
C.	The Italian Model: Strong Ex Ante and Weak Ex Post Oversight of Budget .....	209
III.	The Impact of European Economic Governance.....	212
IV.	The Trade-Off between Budgetary Decision-Making and Oversight: Unchallenged by the European Parliament .....	215
9.	Conclusions: From Law-Making to Oversight? A Concrete Perspective for European Parliamentarism.....	219
	<i>Bibliography</i> .....	225
	<i>Index</i> .....	265