

# Women, Poverty, Equality

## The Role of CEDAW

UBS 9630

Meghan Campbell

Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche Biblioteca
Inv. DSP 6688
Coll. INT PUB. 341. II. 2292



• HART •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2018

# Contents

*Acknowledgements* ..... v

## Part I

1. Mapping the Problem ..... 3

- I. Defining Gender-Based Poverty ..... 8
  - A. A New Conception of Poverty..... 8
  - B. Recognising and Defining Gender-Based Poverty..... 10
- II. Gender-Based Poverty as an Obstacle to Human Rights ..... 16
- III. The Gap in the International Human Rights Framework ..... 19
- IV. The Promise of CEDAW in Addressing Gender-Based Poverty ..... 21
- V. Mapping the Solution: An Evolutionary Interpretation of CEDAW ..... 24
- VI. Conclusion ..... 28

2. The Drafting of CEDAW ..... 29

- I. Understanding the Past..... 30
- II. The History of CEDAW ..... 34
- III. Mapping Gender-Based Poverty in the *Travaux Préparatoires* ..... 37
- IV. Explaining CEDAW's Silence ..... 41
  - A. Gender-Based Poverty Separate from Gender Equality ..... 42
    - (i) Gender-Based Poverty as Politics ..... 42
    - (ii) Gender-Based Poverty as Development..... 44
  - B. The Politics of the Cold War ..... 48
  - C. The Expense of Gender-Based Poverty ..... 53
- V. Conclusion ..... 54

3. Strategies for Interpreting CEDAW ..... 56

- I. The Art of Interpretation..... 58
  - A. Articles 31–33 of the VCLT..... 58
  - B. As Time Goes By: Evolutionary Interpretation ..... 60
  - C. Apples and Oranges: Comparative Interpretation ..... 62
- II. The Interpretative Role of UN Human Rights Bodies..... 65
  - A. Treaty Bodies ..... 66
  - B. Charter-Based Bodies ..... 68
- III. Gender-Based Poverty and the UN Human Rights Bodies ..... 70
  - A. An Incomplete Approach: Treaty-Based Bodies ..... 70

(i)	Gender-Based Poverty in ICCPR and ICESCR.....	71
(ii)	Poverty in ICCPR and ICESCR .....	72
B.	The Indivisibility of Rights: Gender-Based Poverty and the UN Charter Bodies .....	75
IV.	Conclusion .....	78
4.	<b>Interpreting Gender-Based Poverty into CEDAW</b> .....	79
I.	Potential Interpretations of CEDAW .....	80
A.	The Limits of the Specific Right Approach .....	80
B.	Gender-Based Violence and CEDAW.....	83
II.	A Comprehensive Interpretation: Equality and Non-Discrimination in CEDAW .....	88
A.	The Role of Equality and Non-Discrimination in CEDAW .....	88
B.	Applying the VCLT Framework to Equality and Non-Discrimination in CEDAW.....	89
(i)	The Ordinary Meaning .....	90
(ii)	Context .....	97
(iii)	The Object and Purpose .....	114
(iv)	A New Interpretation of CEDAW .....	118
III.	Nature of the State's Obligations .....	119
A.	The Obligation to Realise Socioeconomic Rights .....	120
B.	The Obligation to Eliminate Discrimination and Achieve Gender Equality in CEDAW.....	123
C.	A Duty to Cooperate to Tackle Gender-Based Poverty? .....	131
IV.	Conclusion .....	133

## Part II

5.	<b>The Committee and Gender-Based Poverty</b> .....	137
I.	CEDAW's Accountability Structure .....	139
II.	Mapping the Committee's Approach to Gender-Based Poverty .....	140
A.	The Disadvantage Dimension.....	142
(i)	Gender-Based Poverty & Economic and Social Life.....	143
(ii)	Trafficking and Prostitution .....	145
(iii)	Civil and Political Rights.....	147
(iv)	Economic and Social Rights .....	148
(v)	Family Life .....	152
B.	The Recognition Dimension .....	153
(i)	Gender-Based Poverty & Economic and Social Life.....	154



(ii)	Gender-Based Violence .....	156
(iii)	Cultural Attitudes and Stereotypes .....	157
(iv)	Prostitution .....	158
(v)	Economic and Social Rights .....	158
(vi)	Access to Justice .....	160
(vii)	Family Life .....	161
C.	The Structural Dimension .....	162
(i)	Gender-Based Poverty & Economic and Social Life.....	162
(ii)	Civil and Political Rights.....	163
(iii)	Economic and Social Rights .....	164
(iv)	Access to Justice.....	165
(v)	Family Life .....	166
D.	The Participation Dimension.....	167
(i)	Gender-Based Poverty & Economic and Social Life.....	167
(ii)	Civil and Political Rights.....	168
(iii)	Economic and Social Rights .....	168
E.	The Interaction between the Four Dimensions of Transformative Equality.....	169
(i)	Rural Women .....	170
(ii)	Health .....	172
III.	Evaluative Discussion .....	174
IV.	Conclusion .....	176
6.	The Working Methods of the Committee .....	177
I.	Mapping Gender-Based Poverty and the Committee.....	180
II.	A Case Study on the Committee's Working Methods and Gender-Based Poverty.....	183
A.	Working Methods of the Periodic Reporting Process.....	184
B.	Analysis of Material in the Periodic Reporting Process....	186
(i)	Common Core Document .....	186
(ii)	The State Report .....	187
(iii)	CSO Reports .....	192
(iv)	List of Issues.....	196
(v)	State Reply .....	199
(vi)	UN Agencies .....	200
(vii)	Summary Records .....	200
C.	Conclusions.....	201
III.	Reforming the Periodic Reporting Process.....	202
A.	Analysis of the CEDAW Reporting Guidelines .....	203
B.	Reforming the CEDAW Reporting Guidelines.....	206
IV.	Conclusion .....	207

7. Evolutionary General Recommendations .....	209
I. The Purpose of General Recommendations .....	210
II. Evolutionary General Recommendations.....	213
A. Introducing the Evolution in International Human Rights Law.....	214
B. The Legal Analysis to Support the Evolutionary Interpretation .....	216
C. Contextualising the Evolutionary Interpretation of the Treaty.....	219
III. Conclusion .....	221
8. Envisioning Gender-Based Poverty in CEDAW .....	223
I. Introducing Gender-Based Poverty into CEDAW.....	224
II. A New Interpretation: The Legal Basis for Interpreting Gender-Based Poverty into CEDAW .....	229
III. Contextualising Gender-Based Poverty in CEDAW.....	233
A. Gender-Based Poverty and Women’s Human Rights.....	233
B. Accountability for Gender-Based Poverty .....	245
C. Guidance on Periodic Reporting Process .....	246
IV. Conclusion .....	247
 <i>Annex</i> .....	 249
<i>Index</i> .....	275