

SALVATORE VERNUCCIO

MIL 1012129

**THE ABUSE OF EXCESSIVE PRICING
AND THE CASE OF
THE PHARMACEUTICAL SECTOR**



Wolters Kluwer

CEDAM

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	XI
--------------------	----

CHAPTER I

THE ABUSE OF EXCESSIVE PRICING

1. Excessive Pricing as an Exploitative and/or Exclusionary Abuse.....	1
2. History, Philosophy and Morals.....	2

CHAPTER II

ASSESSMENT

1. Methods for Determining Which Price is Excessive.....	6
1.1. Introductory Remarks.....	6
1.2. A Price is Excessive When Above the Competitive Level.....	9
1.3. Comparison with Other Prices of the Dominant Firm.....	10
1.3.1. Historic Benchmarking.....	11
1.3.1.1. Retrospective Benchmark.....	12
1.4. Comparison with Price of Other Firms Offering Similar Product Than Those of the Dominant Firm.....	14
1.4.1. Issues with Using Prices Practiced by Other Firms as Benchmarks.....	16
1.4.1.1. Patented vs. Unpatented Products.....	17
1.4.1.2. Regulated vs. Liberalised Markets.....	19
1.4.1.3. Geographic Comparison and its Critics.....	19
1.5. "I Know it When I See it" Approach.....	20
1.6. Profitability Analysis.....	22

1.6.1.	Accounting vs. Financial Approach to Profitability Analysis.....	23
1.6.2.	Critics to Profitability Analysis.....	24
2.	Evaluating Prices in Other Fields of Competition Law.....	25

CHAPTER III

ENFORCEMENT

1.	Whether to Enforce.....	32
1.1.	Arguments for Non-Intervention.....	33
1.1.1.	Excessive Prices are Self-Correcting and Enforcing the Prohibition of Excessive Pricing Would Deter Entry.....	34
1.1.2.	Absence of a Clear and Predictable Rule of Conduct for Firms.....	35
1.1.3.	Chilling Effects on Innovation: Losing Dynamic Efficiency.....	36
1.1.4.	Type I Errors are More Costly Than Type II Errors.....	37
1.1.5.	Competition Authorities are not Regulators.....	38
1.1.6.	Excessive Pricing Cases Demand too Much Resources, Diminishing Those Available for Other Investigations.....	39
1.1.7.	Few Prospects of Successful Enforcement.....	40
1.1.8.	Competition Authorities' Decisions Finding an Abuse of Excessive Pricing Could Spur Private Damage Suits.....	41
1.1.9.	Alternative Remedies Already Exist.....	41
1.2.	Arguments for Intervention.....	42
1.2.1.	Excessive Prices do not Always Self-Correct.....	43
1.2.2.	Difficulties in Assessing Price Excessiveness Shall not be Overstated.....	45
1.2.3.	The Topic has not Been Sufficiently Investigated and Negative Consequences of Excessive Pricing Might Have Been Underestimated.....	46
1.2.3.	Effects on Innovation are Uncertain and Need to be Verified Empirically.....	47
1.2.4.	Limited Effects on Entrance.....	48
1.2.5.	Excessive Pricing as a "Textbook" Justification for Antitrust Intervention.....	49
1.2.6.	Costs Associated with Intervention are not Necessarily Greater Than Those Associated with Non-Intervention.....	51

1.2.7. Regulatory Deficiencies	51
1.2.8. Competition Authorities and Courts can Deal with Excessive Pricing without Turning into Price-Regulators	52
1.2.9. Administrative Advantages in Having Competition Authorities Dealing with Excessive Pricing Cases	54
1.2.10. Possibility for a Second-Shot and Gap Cases	54
1.2.11. Deterrent Effects	55
1.2.12. Exclusionary Conducts are not a Prerequisite to Prosecute Excessive Pricing	56
2. Screens: When to Enforce	57
2.1. Types of Screens	57
2.1.1. High and Non-Transitory Entry Barriers	57
2.1.2. Super Dominance	59
2.1.3. Dominance is the Result of Competition on Merits	59
2.1.4. No Intervention During Patent Life	60
2.1.5. (Highly) Inelastic Demand	61
2.1.6. No Sector Regulator Exists	61
2.1.7. Future Competition is Expected	62
2.1.8. Absence of Intermediaries Between the Incumbent and End-Consumers	63
2.1.9. Indispensability of the Product	63

CHAPTER IV

COUNTRIES' APPROACHES AND CASES

1. The United States of America	69
2. The European Union	74
3. Russia	83
4. Israel	86

CHAPTER V

PECULIARITIES OF THE PHARMACEUTICAL MARKET

1. Demand-Side Considerations	92
1.1. The Social Importance of the Pharmaceutical Sector	92
1.2. Inelasticity of the Demand and Information Asymmetry	93
2. Supply-Side Considerations	95
2.1. A Highly Regulated Sector	96

2.2.	The Role of Innovation and the Costs of R&D.....	98
2.3.	Shift from Primary Care to Speciality Drugs, Biologics and Orphan Drugs.....	103
2.4.	The Costs of new Drugs.....	105
2.5.	IPRs in the Pharmaceutical Sector.....	109

CHAPTER VI

EXCESSIVE PRICING IN THE PHARMACEUTICAL SECTOR

1.	High Prices in the Pharmaceutical Market.....	117
1.1.	Types.....	118
1.1.1.	Increase of Average Drug Prices.....	118
1.1.2.	Price Gouging.....	119
1.1.3.	High Launch Prices.....	120
1.2.	Causes.....	121
1.3.	Are High Prices Good or Bad for Society?.....	123
2.	Assessment: Economic Profitability and the Difficulties in the Pharmaceutical Sector.....	125
3.	Recent Excessive Pricing and High Pricing Cases.....	127
3.1.	Aspen (Italy).....	128
3.2.	Aspen (European Union).....	130
3.3.	Flynn Pharma and Other UK Cases.....	133

CHAPTER VII

REMEDIES

1.	Regulatory Remedies.....	141
1.1.	Facilitating Access to the Market.....	143
1.2.	Price Regulation and Price Caps.....	149
1.3.	Reference Pricing.....	152
1.4.	Rate of Return Regulation.....	153
2.	Structural Remedies.....	154
2.1.	Compulsory Licensing.....	155
2.2.	Government's March-in Right Type Provisions....	161
2.3.	Create a Publicly-Owned Company Serving the Market.....	164
3.	Behavioural Remedies and Fines.....	165
4.	Increasing Transparency.....	166
5.	Advocacy and Other Ways to Turn on the Spotlight.....	169
6.	Prosecuting Exclusionary Abuses.....	169
7.	Private Enforcement.....	172

CONCLUSIVE REMARKS	175
BIBLIOGRAPHY	181
Legislation	181
Case Law	182
Literature	189
Online Resources	225
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	241