

V317 C 11224

Comparative Federalism

Constitutional Arrangements
and Case Law

Francesco Palermo and Karl Kössler

Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche Biblioteca
Inv. DSP 6541
Coll. COST-41R.C. 563



• HART •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2017

Contents

Preface	v
Table of Cases	xiii
Introduction	1
0.1 Why This Book and What to Expect from it	1
0.2 Understanding Federalism—Understanding of Federalism	3
0.3 Methodology and Terminology	5
0.3.1 The Comparative Method	5
0.3.2 Terminology	8
0.4 Structure	10
Part I: Foundations	
1 Concepts.....	13
1.1 Federalism.....	13
1.1.1 Traditions in Conceptualising Federalism	14
1.1.2 Federalism and Federation—Towards Common Ground.....	17
1.2 Regionalism	20
1.2.1 Regionalisation vs Regionalism	22
1.2.2 New Regionalism, Multilevel Governance and the ‘Europe of the Regions’	25
1.2.3 The Proliferation of Regionalisms	30
2 Manifestations.....	34
2.1 Confederation	35
2.1.1 Definition	35
2.1.2 Are Confederations Transitional?	36
2.2 Federal State	38
2.2.1 The Compact as the Traditional Definition: The ‘Federal Big Bang’	38
2.2.2 Form Follows Function: The Role of History in Shaping Federal Manifestations	42
2.2.3 Definition by Means of Institutional Elements	47
2.3 Regional State and Related Manifestations	50
2.3.1 Definition and Relation to the Federal State	50
2.3.2 Rationale and Cases	51
2.3.3 Devolution	55
2.3.4 Autonomy and Similar Manifestations	58
2.4 The EU: Federalism Beyond the State?	61
2.5 Living Without Definitions.....	64

3.	History	67
3.1	Ancient Unions	67
3.2	The Age of Confederations	68
3.2.1	Classical European Confederations	68
3.2.2	The United States of America under the Articles of Confederation	70
3.3	Archetypes of the Federal State	72
3.3.1	The United States of America (1787)	72
3.3.2	Switzerland (1848)	76
3.3.3	Germany (1867/1871)	79
4.	Debates.....	83
4.1	Sovereignty in Federal Systems: Indivisible or Shared?	83
4.1.1	The Theory of Indivisible Sovereignty and Its Contestation	84
4.1.2	Divided Sovereignty in the United States and Beyond	88
4.1.3	The Sovereignty Question in the European Union	92
4.2	Federalism in Diverse Societies: Cure or Curse?	97
4.2.1	Multinational Federalism as a Concept	98
4.2.2	The Legal Status of Internal Minorities	101
4.2.3	Secession under Federal Constitutions	105
4.3	Federalism and Participatory Democracy in an Era of Pluralism	111
4.3.1	Federalism and Participatory Democracy: Two Faces of Pluralism.....	111
4.3.2	The Crisis of Democracy: An Opportunity for Federalism?	114
Part II: Self-Rule and Shared Rule		
5.	Autonomy of Subnational Entities	125
5.1	The Constitutional Dimension: Constitutional Autonomy	126
5.1.1	Definition and Scope	126
5.1.2	Limits to Constitutional Autonomy: Supremacy and Homogeneity Clauses	130
5.1.3	Practical Use of Constitutional Autonomy.....	136
5.2	The Legislative Dimension: Distribution of Legislative Powers	139
5.2.1	Distribution of Powers and the Residual Clause	139
5.2.2	Dual vs Cooperative Systems.....	146
5.2.3	Flexibilisation and Centralisation: Implied Powers.....	149
5.3	The Administrative Dimension: The Relationship between Legislative and Administrative Powers	156
5.4	The Judicial Dimension: The Court Systems	159
6.	Participation of Subnational Entities at the National Level.....	164
6.1	Scope, Institutions and Procedures for Participation	164
6.2	Institutional Forms of Participation	165
6.2.1	Second Chambers	165
6.2.1.1	Origins and Constitutional Entrenchment	167
6.2.1.2	The Senate Model: Variations, Appointment and Composition.....	169

6.2.1.3	The Council (or Ambassadorial) Model: A Germany Legacy	172
6.2.1.4	Hybrid Second Chambers	176
6.2.2	Intergovernmental Bodies	177
6.3	Procedural Forms of Participation	178
6.3.1	Constitutional Amendment	178
6.3.1.1	Direct Participation by the Legislatures or Electorates of Subnational Entities	179
6.3.1.2	Indirect (or Absence of) Participation Through Second Chambers	183
6.3.2	Territorial Changes	186
6.3.3	Legislative (and Administrative) Functions	190
6.3.4	Appointments	193
6.3.5	Other Functions	199
7.	Financial Relations	201
7.1	Financial Relations: Significance, Scope and Regulation	201
7.1.1	Significance	201
7.1.2	Scope: Local and Supranational Dimensions	202
7.1.3	Regulation: Legal Sources and (A)Symmetrical Design	205
7.2	Revenue Powers	210
7.2.1	Types of Subnational Entities' Own Revenues	210
7.2.2	Taxing Powers	211
7.2.3	A Trend Towards Tax Centralisation?	222
7.3	Spending Power	228
7.3.1	Spending Power and Conditional Grants	228
7.3.2	Legal Basis and Limits of the General Spending Power	229
7.3.3	Spending Power and Fiscal Discipline	235
7.4	Equalisation	240
8.	Prevention and Resolution of Conflicts	246
8.1	Intergovernmental Relations	246
8.1.1	Principles: Federal Loyalty and Similar Precepts	249
8.1.2	Institutions: The Predominance of the Executive Branch	253
8.1.3	Instruments: Delegation and Intergovernmental Agreements	257
8.2	Ex ante Scrutiny of Subnational Law	261
8.2.1	Judicial Scrutiny of Draft Legislation	261
8.2.2	Political or Judicial Scrutiny of Subnational Constitutions	263
8.3	Constitutional Adjudication	266
8.3.1	Significance, Scope and Impact	266
8.3.2	Constitutional Review and Other Functions	272
9.	Local Government	281
9.1	Local Government in a Changed Factual and Legal Context	281
9.2	Legal Recognition of Local Self-Government	284
9.2.1	Source of Recognition	285

9.2.2	Scope and Quality of Recognition	286
9.2.3	The Problem of (Over)Regulation.....	287
9.3	Powers of Local Governments.....	290
9.3.1	Assignment of Local Powers	290
9.3.2	Restrictions of the Exercise of Local Powers.....	295
9.3.2.1	Overburdening with Delegated Tasks	295
9.3.2.2	Supervision Prevailing over Intergovernmental Collaboration	297
9.3.2.3	Limited Financial Resources	300
9.4	Structure of Local Government	305
9.4.1	Amalgamation.....	305
9.4.2	Inter-municipal Cooperation.....	309
9.4.3	Umbrella Entities	312
9.5	Local Government as a Genuine Third Level?.....	314
Part III: Powers and Policies: Between Autonomy and Homogeneity		
10.	Fundamental Rights.....	321
10.1	United States of America	322
10.2	Switzerland	327
10.3	Canada	330
10.4	Germany	333
10.5	Spain.....	338
10.6	Comparative Conclusions	341
11.	Social Welfare and Healthcare	346
11.1	United States	349
11.2	Canada	355
11.3	Belgium.....	361
11.4	Spain.....	365
11.5	United Kingdom.....	370
11.6	Comparative Conclusions	376
12.	Environmental Protection.....	382
12.1	United States	383
12.2	Switzerland	387
12.3	Germany	391
12.4	Italy	393
12.5	United Kingdom.....	396
12.6	Comparative Conclusions	398
13.	Immigration and Migrant Integration.....	403
13.1	Switzerland	404
13.2	Canada	407
13.3	Australia	411
13.4	Germany.....	412
13.5	Belgium.....	415
13.6	Comparative Conclusions	418

14.	External Relations	423
14.1	United States	425
14.2	Switzerland	428
14.3	Canada	431
14.4	Belgium.....	436
14.5	Spain.....	439
14.6	Comparative Conclusions	443
15.	Concluding Remarks	448
15.1	Federalism in the Twenty-First Century.....	448
15.2	A Federal Research Agenda: The Four ‘Ps’	449
	<i>Index</i>	453