

UDC 422.07.00

# EU Health Law & Policy

*The Expansion of EU Power in Public Health  
and Health Care*

ANNIEK DE RUIJTER

*Associate Professor of European Law, University of Amsterdam*

|   |
|---|
| Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche<br>Biblioteca |
| Inv. DSP 7421                                   |
| Coll. ORGINT. 341.1. e. 1646                    |

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Table of Cases</i>   | xv        |
| <i>Table of Legislation</i>   | xix       |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i>  | xxxiii    |
| <i>List of Respondents</i>  | xxxv      |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>1. The Silent Revolution in EU Health Law and Policy</b>                   | <b>1</b>  |
| 1. Human Health, Values, Rights, and the European Union                       | 2         |
| 2. The Expanding Power of the EU in Human Health                              | 4         |
| 2.1 Limited legislative power ...   | 5         |
| 2.2 ... but ever-growing policymaking authority                               | 6         |
| 3. Health Law: Rights and Functions   | 8         |
| 4. The Structure of the Book and Methodology of the Research                  | 10        |
| 4.1 Legal framework for analysis: fundamental rights beyond justiciability    | 11        |
| 4.2 Case studies: public health and health care                               | 12        |
| 4.2.1 Public health: communicable disease outbreak                            | 13        |
| 4.2.2 Health care: access to medical care                                     | 14        |
| 4.3 Data sources: beyond law  | 14        |
| 5. Balancing Subsidiarity and Fundamental Rights                              | 15        |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>2. European Union Rights and Values in Human Health</b>                    | <b>16</b> |
| 1. Legitimizing the Use of Power in Human Health Policy and Law               | 16        |
| 1.1 Reciprocity of fundamental rights and health law and policy               | 18        |
| 2. From 'Generations' towards the 'Indivisibility' of Rights in Human Health  | 20        |
| 2.1 First-generation rights and health policy                                 | 20        |
| 2.2 Second-generation rights and health policy                                | 23        |
| 2.3 Third-generation rights and health policy                                 | 25        |
| 2.4 Towards indivisibility  | 26        |
| 3. The EU's Fundamental Rights Framework in Human Health                      | 26        |
| 3.1 The scope of application of fundamental rights to EU health policy        | 29        |
| 3.2 The Charter and the European Convention on Human Rights                   | 29        |
| 3.3 Scope of application of fundamental rights                                | 30        |
| 3.3.1 Invoking fundamental rights against EU institutional actors             | 31        |
| 3.3.2 Invoking EU fundamental rights against Member States                    | 32        |
| 3.3.3 Application of fundamental rights without a Union law obligation        | 34        |
| 3.4 Applicability of other fundamental rights instruments to EU health policy | 35        |
| 4. EU Fundamental Rights in Public Health and Health Care                     | 39        |
| 4.1 The first branch: right to health in health care and public health        | 40        |
| 4.1.1 The right to health: public health                                      | 41        |
| 4.1.2 The right to health: access to health care                              | 44        |
| 4.2 The second branch: individual (patients') rights                          | 46        |
| 4.2.1 Informed consent in public health and health care                       | 46        |

- 4.2.2 Privacy and confidentiality in public health and health care
- 5. Fundamental Rights: Beyond a Legal Framework

### 3. EU 'Public Health' and 'Health-care' Law and Policy

1. Human 'Health' in the EU
  - 1.1 Legal sources defining health in the EU
  - 1.2 Beyond a biomedical concept
  - 1.3 Differentiating EU 'public health' and 'individual health (care)'
2. EU Power: Policy and Law in Human Health
  - 2.1 Human health as part of the EU regulatory state
  - 2.2 Authority: policymaking and power
  - 2.3 Differentiating EU 'health-care' and 'public health' policy
3. EU Public Health Policy and Law
  - 3.1 Public health in the Common Agricultural Policy
  - 3.2 EU public health to promote the free movement of goods
  - 3.3 Mutual recognition
  - 3.4 Tensions between internal market and public health objectives
    - 3.4.1 HIV/AIDS programme and blood products
    - 3.4.2 Constitutional tensions over tobacco advertising
  - 3.5 Treaty bases for public health: reconciling different objectives
  - 3.6 Redistributing through public health programmes
  - 3.7 The Treaty gives and the Treaty takes: legislative basis
4. EU Health-care Policy and Law
  - 4.1 Cross-border health care: angry letters and private litigation
    - 4.1.1 Medical tourism or medical need?
    - 4.1.2 Health professionals and health services in Union law
    - 4.1.3 Special consideration for health care in competition and procurement law
    - 4.1.4 EU involvement through 'soft' governance tools
    - 4.1.5 Pressures and constraints for EU health-care policy
  - 4.2 Overlapping EU public health and health-care policy
    - 4.2.1 Divides in EU health policy
5. EU Power in Health Law and Policy

### 4. Institutional Build-up of EU Health Actors

1. Expanding EU Institutional Power
2. Health Policy in the European Commission
  - 2.1 The early days
    - 2.1.1 Euratom 1958: occupational public health
    - 2.1.2 EEC Treaty 1958: free movement of workers
  - 2.2 Fragmentation of health policy in the Commission
    - 2.2.1 1967 Merger Treaty: health in the CAP
  - 2.3 DG SANTE: the EU department for health
  - 2.4 The role of the European Commission in human health
3. Health Policy in the European Parliament
  - 3.1 The early days: health policy across parliamentary committees
  - 3.2 The ENVI Committee: expanding power
  - 3.3 The role of the European Parliament

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 4. Health Policy in the Council of the European Union   | 105 |
| 4.1 At the level of ministers: the EPSCO Council  | 105 |
| 4.2 Lower-level Member State representatives for health in the Council                            | 107 |
| 4.2.1 The Council Working Party on Public Health  | 108 |
| 4.2.2 The Working Party on Public Health at senior level  | 108 |
| 4.3 The role of the Council   | 109 |
| 5. Health Policy in Committees, Expert Groups, and Fora   | 110 |
| 5.1 Independent scientific committees   | 111 |
| 5.2 Committees and groups with a political role, and private interests lobby                      | 111 |
| 5.3 Lower-level legislation through committees in health  | 112 |
| 5.4 The role of committees and experts in EU health policy  | 114 |
| 6. Health Policy in European Agencies   | 115 |
| 6.1 Agencies for health policy  | 116 |
| 6.2 The role of EU agencies   | 118 |
| 7. Growing Institutional Capacity to Make EU Health Policy and Law                                | 119 |
| <br>  |     |
| 5. EU Public Health: Countermeasures to Swine Flu   | 121 |
| 1. The 2009 Outbreak of Swine Flu and the EU Response   | 121 |
| 1.1 The role of EU institutional actors   | 123 |
| 1.2 Commission services' role in early warning and response                                       | 124 |
| 1.3 The network committee for communicable diseases   | 124 |
| 1.3.1 Other instruments for response: surveillance and Rapid Response Systems (RAS)               | 125 |
| 1.4 The Health Security Committee   | 127 |
| 1.5 Ad hoc policy coordination in the Council: friends of the presidency                          | 129 |
| 1.6 The agencies: the ECDC and the EMA  | 130 |
| 2. EU Countermeasures to Swine Flu  | 130 |
| 2.1 Market authorization of vaccines and antivirals, and defining priority groups for vaccination | 131 |
| 2.1.1 Defining priority groups for vaccination  | 133 |
| 2.2 Information exchange, contact tracing, and passenger screening                                | 134 |
| 2.3 School closures, delaying strategies, and information to the public                           | 135 |
| 2.4 The role of the EU in taking countermeasures to the swine flu outbreak                        | 136 |
| 3. Expanding EU Health Policymaking: Linking Practices to Law                                     | 136 |
| 3.1 Linking the Health Security Committee with the EWRS Committee                                 | 137 |
| 3.2 Ad hoc policymaking as bedrock for law  | 138 |
| 4. The Impact of EU Public Health Policy on Fundamental Rights and Values                         | 141 |
| 4.1 Individual rights   | 141 |
| 4.1.1 Market authorization of vaccines and defining priority groups for vaccination               | 142 |
| 4.1.2 Information exchange, contact tracing, and passenger screening                              | 143 |
| 4.2 The right to health   | 144 |
| 4.2.1 Market authorization of vaccines and defining priority groups for vaccination               | 146 |
| 4.2.2 Information exchange, contact tracing, and passenger screening                              | 148 |
| 4.2.3 School closures, delaying strategies, and information to the public                         | 149 |
| 5. The Impact of Intertwining Informal Coordination and Formal Law                                | 149 |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>6. EU Health Care: Access to Medical Care</b>  | <b>151</b> |
| 1. Access to Cross-border Health Care before and after the Directive  | 151        |
| 1.1 Access to health care before the adoption of the Directive  | 153        |
| 1.1.1 Planned care: prior authorization   | 153        |
| 1.2 Access to cross-border health care on the basis of the free movement principles                           | 154        |
| 1.3 Access to health care after the adoption of the Directive   | 156        |
| 1.3.1 Two schemes for access to cross-border health care: what difference?                                    | 157        |
| 1.3.2 Implementation and delegation: possibilities for expanding the EU's role in health care                 | 158        |
| 1.4 Cross-border health care: a hot-button issue  | 159        |
| 2. The Adoption of the Directive: Creating a Policy Discourse on Values and Rights                            | 160        |
| 2.1 The first evolutionary stage: DG MARKT  | 160        |
| 2.2 The second evolutionary stage: DG SANTE—taking a ‘health values and rights’ approach                      | 162        |
| 2.3 The third evolutionary stage: the ‘Council proposal’—bringing in the Member States                        | 164        |
| 2.4 Opposing values: market versus health   | 165        |
| 2.5 The paradoxical expansion of power through limits and circumscriptions                                    | 166        |
| 3. A Thousand Stones and You Have a Wall: Health Policy and Law beyond the Market                             | 167        |
| 3.1 Institutionalizing the policy discourse   | 168        |
| 3.2 From a policy debate on health values to law  | 168        |
| 4. Access to Medical Care in the EU: Impact on Values and Rights  | 169        |
| 4.1 The right to health: the quality and safety of health care in the Directive                               | 170        |
| 4.2 The right to health: prior authorization in the Directive   | 171        |
| 4.3 The impact of EU health policy on individual rights   | 172        |
| 4.4 Individual rights: informed consent in the Directive  | 172        |
| 4.5 Individual rights: the right to privacy and data protection   | 174        |
| 5. The Impact of the Struggle over Policy Frames: The Market, Health, Values, and Rights                      | 174        |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>7. The EU Constitutional Constraints on the Intrinsic Relationship of Values, Rights, and Human Health</b> | <b>176</b> |
| 1. The Juxtaposition: Health Law and the EU Internal Market   | 176        |
| 2. Silent Revolution: Implicit Fundamental Rights and Value Implications                                      | 178        |
| 2.1 Vertical implications: between the EU and the Member States   | 179        |
| 2.1.1 Health care   | 179        |
| 2.1.2 Public health   | 179        |
| 2.2 Horizontal implications: between (institutionally defined) policy domains                                 | 180        |
| 2.2.1 Health care   | 180        |
| 2.2.2 Public health   | 181        |

|   |         |
|---|---------|
| 3. Depoliticization as a Constitutional Constraint on Human Health Regulation                   | 183     |
| 3.1 Limiting values, rights, and welfare perspectives   | 183     |
| 3.2 The legitimating function of human health considerations, without constitutional protection | 185     |
| 4. Common Values and Rights in EU Human Health Policy and Law?                                  | 186     |
| 4.1 The relationship between values and fundamental rights in health                            | 187     |
| 4.2 EU health values  | 188     |
| 5. EU Powers in Public Health and Health Care into the Future                                   | 189     |
| <br><i>Bibliography</i>   | <br>193 |
| <i>Index</i>  | 207     |