

High Crimes and Misdemeanors

A HISTORY OF IMPEACHMENT FOR
THE AGE OF TRUMP

FRANK O. BOWMAN III



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	page	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xiv
Introduction		1
1 How to Interpret the Constitution's Impeachment Clauses		7
Constitutional Interpretation and the Judiciary		7
Sources of Constitutional Meaning		11
2 British Impeachments, 1376–1787		22
The Origins of Impeachment		23
The First British Impeachments		26
Bills of Attainder		29
Impeachment in the Era of the Stuart Kings		30
The Glorious Revolution of 1688 and the Last Flurry of British Impeachments, 1715–16		39
The Impeachment of Warren Hastings		39
Lessons of British Impeachments for American Practice		47
Impeachment, Crime, Treason, and Retrospective Punishment		47
The Meaning of “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” in British Practice		45
The Scope of Impeachable Conduct in Great Britain		46
Non-Political Impeachments: Armed Rebellion and Ordinary Criminality		46
Corruption		46
Incompetence, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office		47
Abuse of Power		47
Betrayal of the Nation's Foreign Policy		48
Subversion of the Constitution and Laws of the Realm		48
3 American Impeachments before 1787		50
Colonial Impeachments, 1607–1776		50

	The First Colonial Impeachments: Maryland, 1669–83	53
	Colonial Impeachments in Pennsylvania	55
	The Impeachment of Nicholas Moore, 1685	55
	The Impeachment of James Logan, 1707	56
	The Impeachment of William Moore, 1757–59	57
	Colonial Impeachments in Massachusetts	61
	The Impeachment of Samuel Vetch	61
	Impeachment of Chief Justice Peter Oliver, 1774	61
	Impeachment in the Newly Independent States, 1776–1888	65
	Procedural Structure of State Impeachments	67
	Persons Subject to Impeachment and Available Penalties	69
	The Definition of Impeachable Conduct	70
	Impeachment Practice in the States, 1776–87	72
	The Influence of Early American Impeachments on the American Constitutional Founders	73
	Appendix A: Impeachment Provisions of State Constitutions, 1776–87	75
4	The Founders' Impeachment	80
	Constitutional Architecture	83
	The Convention's Impeachment Debates	89
	Shall the President be Impeachable?	89
	By Whom Should the President be Impeached and Tried?	90
	What Shall be the Procedures in an Impeachment?	91
	What Shall be the Consequence of Impeachment?	92
	“High Crimes and Misdemeanors”: What Shall Constitute Impeachable Conduct?	94
	The Influence of British and American Precedents on the Founders'	
	Understanding of “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”	99
	Armed Rebellion and Treason	103
	Crime	103
	Corruption	105
	Betrayal of the Country's Foreign Policy Interests	106
	Incompetence, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office	107
	Subversion of the Constitution	109
5	Impeaching Legislators and Lesser Executive Branch Officials	112
	Impeaching Congress: Constitutional Text and What the Founders Thought	112
	The Impeachment of Senator William Blount, 1797–98	114
	Additional Lessons from the Blount Affair	120
	Interpretive Authority	120
	Foreign Affairs	121
	The Impeachment of Secretary of War Belknap	122
	<i>The Loneliness of Secretary Belknap</i>	124

6	Impeachment of Judges	126
	The Constitutional Text and the Founders' Understanding	126
	The Constitutional Standard for Judicial Impeachment	127
	The Case of Justice Samuel Chase	128
	Impeachable Judicial Conduct	136
	Treason	136
	Corruption in Office	136
	Incapacity, Neglect of Duty, or Maladministration in Office	137
	Incapacity	137
	Abusive Behavior	140
	Legal Errors	141
	Ordinary Crimes	141
	Perjury and False Statements	142
	Conclusions from Judicial Impeachment Cases	143
7	The Impeachment of Andrew Johnson	146
	The Improbable Rise of Andrew Johnson	147
	The End of the Civil War and the Challenge of Reconstruction	150
	The Failure of "Presidential Reconstruction"	155
	"Radical Reconstruction"	157
	Impeachment in the House of Representatives	164
	The Senate Trial of Andrew Johnson	166
	The Tenure of Office Act	167
	Johnson's Attacks on Congress	170
	The Senate's Verdict and its Reasons	172
	The Impeachment Case that Might Have Been	174
	Lessons from the Johnson Impeachment	178
8	The Fall of President Richard Nixon	180
	Richard Nixon and the Prelude to Watergate	181
	The Watergate Break-in and its Aftermath	185
	The Judiciary Committee's Articles of Impeachment	190
	The Prime Purpose of Presidential Impeachment Is to Protect Constitutional Order	193
	Article 1: Obstruction of the Watergate Investigation	194
	Article 2: Abuse of Power	196
	Article 3: Defiance of Judiciary Committee Subpoenas	199
	Articles of Impeachment Proposed, but Not Approved	200
	The Cambodian Bombing	201
	Emoluments and Tax Evasion	202
	Lessons from the Nixon Impeachment Investigations	202
	The Central Role of Federal Prosecutors	203
	The Federal Grand Jury	204

Contents

	The Judiciary and “Executive Privilege”	205
	The House and Senate Committees	207
	The Press	207
	The Strange Case of William Jefferson Clinton	210
	The President and the Intern	213
	The Independent Counsel Investigation: From Whitewater to Lies about Sex	216
	Proceedings in the House and Senate	222
	Criminal Offenses for Which Presidents Ought and Ought Not be Impeached	224
	Towards a Working Definition of an Impeachable Crime	227
	The Independent Counsel and Congress	231
	The Scope of Impeachable Presidential Conduct: General Principles	235
	The Importance of Constitutional Structure	235
	The Importance of Congress as Finder of Fact and Arbitrer of Constitutional Meaning	236
	The Scope of Impeachable Presidential Conduct	242
	Treason and Bribery	242
	High Crimes and Misdemeanors	244
	Crime is Not Necessary for Impeachment	244
	Crime May Not be Sufficient for Impeachment	245
	Defining an Oxymoron: Non-Criminal “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”	245
	Presidential “High Crimes and Misdemeanors”: A Typology	250
11	Impeachment for Obstruction of Justice	253
	Federal Criminal Obstruction of Justice	255
	Section 1503 Obstruction	256
	Section 1512 Obstruction	256
	“Corruptly”: The Culpable Mental State for Obstruction of Justice	257
	Corrupt Purpose and Presidential Power	258
	Obstruction of Justice as Subversion of the Justice System	260
12	Impeachment for Abuse of the Pardon Power	263
13	Impeachment for Lying	267
	Indictable Falsehoods	267
	Official Lies to the Courts and Congress	268
	Lies to Congress by the President in a Formal, Official Communication	269

	Lies to Congress by Administration Agencies or Officials with the President's Knowledge	271
	Chronic or Pervasive Presidential Falsehoods	271
14	Impeachment for Corruption: Schemes of Peculation, the Emoluments Clauses, and the Avaricious President	277
	The Emoluments Clauses	278
	"Scheme of Peculation"	283
15	The Twenty-fifth Amendment as an Alternative to Impeachment	286
	The Constitution of 1788 and the Problem of Presidential Incapacity	287
	Historical Examples of Presidential Disability	288
	Twenty-fifth Amendment	289
	Beyond the Politics of Trump	293
16	Impeaching Donald Trump	296
	The Case for Impeachment	296
	What if Donald Trump Has Been Compromised by Russia?	297
	A Bill of Particulars	300
	Obstruction of Justice	300
	Subversion of Justice System	301
	Abuse of the Pardon Power	303
	Electoral Misconduct	303
	Corruption	306
	Gross Maladministration, Abuse of Power, Injury to Foreign Policy Interests	307
	Attacks on the Press and Norms of Civil Discourse	309
	Dishonesty	310
	Counting to Sixty-seven in a Tribal Age, or Why Impeachment is Unlikely	311
	Appendix: United States Impeachments, 1789 to Present	316
	William Blount	316
	John Pickering	317
	Samuel Chase	318
	James H. Peck	319
	West H. Humphreys	320
	Andrew Johnson	321
	William W. Belknap	323
	Charles H. Swaine	324
	Robert W. Archbald	326
	George English	328

Harold Louderback	329
Halstead L. Ritter	331
Harry Claiborne	332
Alcee L. Hastings	333
Walter L. Nixon	335
William J. Clinton	336
Samuel B. Kent	337
G. Thomas Porteous, Jr.	338
<i>Notes</i>	342
<i>Index</i>	455