The Interpretation of International Law by Domestic Courts

Uniformity, Diversity, Convergence

Edited by
HELMUT PHILIPP AUST
and
GEORG NOLTE

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
# Contents

Table of Cases
List of Abbreviations  xi
List of Contributors  xxvii

1. Introduction
   Georg Nolte  1

## Part I Foundations and Doctrinal Aspects

2. Principles of Treaty Interpretation: Developed for and Applied by National Courts?
   Michael Waibel  9
   I. Introduction  9
   II. Treaty Interpretation by National Courts in Perspective  10
   III. Minimum Harmonization for Diverse National Judges  13
   IV. The Application of the VCLT by National Courts  19
   V. Contract and Statutory Analogies in Treaty Interpretation by National Courts  26
   VI. Conclusion  32

3. Grounds for the Application of International Rules of Interpretation in National Courts
   André Nollkaemper  34
   I. Introduction  34
   II. Effective Performance of International Obligations  37
   III. The International Quality of Domesticated Norms  42
   IV. External Effects  45
   V. Conclusion  47

4. ‘Contractual’ and ‘Statutory’ Treaty Interpretation in Domestic Courts? Convergence around the Vienna Rules
   Eirik Bjorge  49
   I. Introduction: Classification of Treaties in International Law and the Vienna Rules  49
   II. ‘Contractual’ and ‘Statutory’ Treaty Interpretation in International Law  51
   III. A Minimalist Approach Taken by the French Courts?  55
   IV. A Maximalist Approach of the UK Courts?  62
   V. Conclusion  70
Contents

5. Judicial Dialogue as a Means of Interpretation 72
   Antonios Tzanakopoulos
   I. Introduction 72
   II. Judicial Dialogue Defined and Categorized 73
   III. Judicial Dialogue and Interpretation of International Law 78
   IV. Problems of Judicial Dialogue on the Interpretation of International Law 83
   V. Judicial Dialogue as a (New) Means of Interpretation? 90
   VI. Conclusion 94

6. The Role of the International Rules of Interpretation for the Determination of Direct Effect of International Agreements 96
   Mathias Forteau
   I. Is the Identification of ‘Direct Effect’ a Matter of ‘Interpretation’? 96
   II. Assessment of the Practice: Harmony or Cacophony? 104
   III. Conclusion 112

7. The Interpretation of Unwritten International Law by Domestic Judges 113
   Peter Staubach
   I. Peculiarities of Interpreting Unwritten International Law 113
   II. Methodological Problems and Theoretical Approaches 116
   III. Concluding Observations and Outlook 129

PART II THE PRACTICE OF DOMESTIC COURTS IN CONTEXT

8. Interpretation of Treaties in an International Law-Friendly Framework: The Case of South Africa 135
   Dire Tladi
   I. Introduction 135
   II. Preliminary Issues 137
   III. Construing International Law in South African Courts 141
   IV. Conclusion 151

9. The Law and Politics of the Pro Persona Principle in Latin America 153
   Alejandro Rodiles
   I. Contextualizing and De-contextualizing the Pro Persona Principle 153
   II. An Emerging Ius Constitutionale Commune Americanum? 156
   III. The Push Forward: The Pro Persona Principle in the Case Law of the IACHR 161
   IV. Of Resolute and Reluctant Courts?—The Pro Persona Principle in the Case Law of Colombia’s Constitutional Court and Mexico’s Supreme Court 163
   V. Re-contextualizing the Pro Persona Principle: Concluding Remarks 172
Contents

10. Dynamic and Evolutive Interpretation of the ECHR by Domestic Courts? An Inquiry into the Judicial Architecture of Europe
   Christian Djeffal
   I. Introduction
   II. The Micro Perspective: Member States
   III. The Macro Perspective: Europe
   IV. Concluding Themes
   175

11. Deference to the Executive: The US Debate in Global Perspective
    Julian Arato
    I. Introduction
    II. The Doctrinal Question
    III. Deference to the Executive in the United States and Beyond
    IV. Normative Considerations
    V. Conclusion
    198

    Yukiko Takashiba
    I. Introduction
    II. Factors Limiting the Scope of Treaty Interpretation
    III. Interpretive Practice of the Japanese Judiciary with Respect to Treaties
    IV. Conclusion
    218

13. Treaty Interpretation in Indian Courts: Adherence, Coherence, and Convergence
    Vik Kanwar
    I. Introduction
    II. The Interpretation of International Law in Indian Courts
    III. Treaty Interpretation in India
    IV. Adherence and Coherence
    V. Two Kinds of Adherence
    VI. Corresponding Methods: Doing without Saying
    VII. Nominal Adherence: Saying without Doing
    VIII. Tax Treaties: A Self-Contained Regime?
    IX. From Adherence to Coherence, with a View to Convergence
    X. Concluding Observations
    239
PART III UNIFORMITY, DIVERSITY, CONVERGENCE: THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

14. Diffusion Theories and the Interpretive Approaches of Domestic Courts
   Theresa Reinold
   I. Introduction
   II. International Relations Theory and the Role of Domestic Courts:
       The State of the Art
   III. The Interpretive Approaches of Domestic Courts:
       Between Emulation and Translation
   IV. Conclusion
   267

15. Treaty Interpretation and Global Governance:
    The Role of Domestic Courts
    Achilles Skordas
    I. Scope and Argument
    II. Legal Cultures and the Reality of Divergence
    III. Seeking Compatibility via Translation
    IV. Good Governance and the Rule of Law
    V. International Peace and Security
    VI. Patterns of Interpretation as Enablers of Compatability
    290

16. National Courts and Interpretive Approaches to International Law
    Olga Frishman and Eyal Benvenisti
    I. Introduction
    II. The Underlying Assumptions of the Convergence Thesis
    III. The Case Against the Convergence Thesis
    IV. The Trusteeship Approach as a Middle Ground
    V. Conclusion
    317

17. Between Universal Aspiration and Local Application:
    Concluding Observations
    Helmut Philipp Aust
    I. International Law Between Universal Aspiration and Local Application
    II. Interpretation Between Uniformity and Diversity
    III. The Context for Domestic Court Practice
    IV. The Practical Importance of the Matter
    V. Binding Obligation or Normative Expectation?
    VI. Interpretation and the Rule of Law
    333

Index

347