The Israeli Supreme Court and the Human Rights Revolution

COURTS AS AGENDA SETTERS

Assaf Meydani

School of Government and Society, The Academic College of Tel-Aviv–Yaffo
Contents

Figures and Tables ............................. xi
Acknowledgments ............................. xiii

Introduction .................................... 1

2 The Intervention of the Israeli High Court of Justice in Government Decisions: An Empirical, Quantitative Study with Paradoxical Results
   2.1 On the Method of the Quantitative Study .......................... 6
   2.2 Research Findings ................................ 8
   2.3 From a Descriptive Analysis to a Path-Dependent Analysis: From Intervention to Involvement .................. 11

3 Law and Politics: Theoretical Aspects
   3.1 Political Thought and Legal Thought ............................. 19
   3.2 Major Approaches for Analyzing the Relationship Between Law and Politics .......................... 20
   3.3 The Supreme Court and the Political System in Israel ............ 25
   3.4 Summary and Contribution ................................ 33

4 The Supreme Court as a Political Entrepreneur in the Process of Institutional Change – an Analysis Based on Shared Mental Models and Political Entrepreneurship
   4.1 Institutional Theory ................................ 43
   4.2 The Sociological Perspective of Institutional Theory ............ 44
   4.3 Institutional Theory as Perceived through Social Choice Studies ................................ 45
   4.4 Political Entrepreneurship ................................ 51
   4.5 The Policy-Making Process and Supreme Courts ............... 53
Contents

4.6 The Involvement of the Supreme Court in Policy-Making Processes 58

5 Israeli Public Law
   5.1 Public Law and Human Rights 63
   5.2 The Constitutional Mechanism in Law and Practice 63
   5.3 Israeli Constitutional History and the Human Rights Statement 65
   5.4 The Separation of Powers: The Role of the Israeli Supreme Court in Defending Human Rights in Israel 67
   5.5 A Jewish and Democratic State: An Undefined Human Rights Attitude 68

6 Israel in Light of Structural and Cultural Variables 69
   6.1 The Political Culture: Israel and Its Non-Liberal Culture of Alternative Politics 69
   6.2 The Transformation of Israeli Political Culture: From a Top-Down to a Bottom-Up Orientation in Decision-Making Processes 70
   6.3 Non-Governability in Israel 73
   6.4 The Alternative Politics of the State Economy Arrangement Law 79

7 The Supreme Court and the Political System in Light of Social and Political Processes in Israel during 1948-1999 83
   7.1 Initial Structural and Cultural Conditions 84
   7.2 The 1950s and 1960s: From the Establishment of the State to the Six Day War (1948-1967) 86
   7.3 The 1970s: From the Bergman Petition to the Rubinstein Petition (1967-1982) 90
   7.4 The 1980s: From the Rubinstein Petition to the Passage of Basic Laws: Human Dignity and Freedom of Occupation 94
   7.5 The 1990s: From the Passage of Basic Laws: Human Dignity and Freedom of Occupation to the Zemach Petition (1992-1999) 100

8 The Struggle for a New Conservative Constitutional Court (2000): Redefining the Guarantor of Human Rights in Israel – the Role of the Israeli Supreme Court 106
   8.1 A Constitution for Israel and a Constitutional Court: An Ongoing Debate 107

8.2 The High Court and the Process of Public Policy Making: The Proposal to Create a Constitutional Court of Law (2000) 108

8.3 The Legal System Supported by the Minister of Justice 109

8.4 Politicians – The Goal of Being Re-Elected 109

8.5 The Activities of Interest Groups 111

8.6 In the Political Arena: The Role of the Chair of the Constitutional Committee 112

8.7 The Politicians – the Prime Minister’s Stand 114

   9.1 The Supreme Court Versus the Political System: A Balance of Power (1999-2007) 116
   9.2 The Israeli Supreme Court as a Political Entrepreneur, Providing an Alternative Form of Governability in Controversial Issues 117
   9.3 The Rule of “Who Governs?” as Electoral Capital 119

10 The Supreme Court of Israel as an Agenda Setter: Three Cases 121
   10.1 Judicial Activism in Military Courts: Toward a Human Rights Approach 121
   10.2 The Interrogation Case (1999) 134
   10.3 The Land Decision Case (2002) 136
   10.4 Analyzing Public Policy in the Interrogation Case and the Land Decision Case 137
   10.5 Summary 145

11 On Law, Society, and Policy Design – toward a Reform in the Relationship between the High Court of Justice and the Knesset 147
   11.1 Introduction 147
   11.2 The Shetreet Report 148
   11.3 Discussion of the Legal Literature 149
   11.4 Policy Science 152
   11.5 The Centrality of the High Court of Justice: Non-Governance and the Culture of Alternative Politics 152
## Contents

11.6 An Arrangement That Promotes Governance Is Needed 154
11.7 A Summary – a Proposed Institutional Arrangement 156

12 Conclusion and Normative Implications 162

Bibliography 169
Index 189