

PAR 1260645

A Landscape of Contemporary Theories of International Law

By

Emmanuel Roucouas

Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche Biblioteca
Inv. DSP 7372
Coll. INTPUB. 341. II. 2329



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Acknowledgments	XIII
List of Abbreviations	XIV
Preface: The Choir Group	XVI

PART I

Essential Elements

1	Introduction	3
1.1	Theories about Theory	3
1.2	Theories <i>of or about</i> International Law	11
2	Thoughts on the Impact of Theory on International Law	15
3	Important Elements in the Making of Theory	25
3.1	Ideology	25
3.2	Polysemy of Terms and Concepts: The Role of Language	29
3.3	Limits and Limitations of Theory	36
3.4	History and Histories of International Law	42
3.5	Methodology and Methods	48
3.6	International and Domestic Law: Incorporation, Transformation, Coordination, Order of Execution, Adaptation, Approximation, Fusion, Direct Effect, and Resistance	52
3.6.1	<i>Subsidiarity</i>	61
3.6.2	<i>Inter-judicial Dialogue</i>	63
3.6.3	<i>Legal Pluralism from the Viewpoint of the Relationship between International and Domestic Law</i>	65
3.7	International Legal Theory and Technical and Scientific Expertise	67
4	Adumbrations of the Theoretical Adventure	72
4.1	Some Characteristics	72
4.2	Difficulties in the Assortment of Theorists in Schools and Movements	77

- 5 **Traceability of Antecedents to Current Scholarship** 82
- 5.1 Introduction 82
- 5.2 The Swing between the Two Mainstream Theories 82
- 5.3 Natural Law 83
- 5.4 Positivism(s) 84
- 5.5 Responses to Traditional Voluntarist Positivism 86
- 5.6 Normativism (a System Governed by Legal Norms) 87
- 5.7 Aspects of the Sociological Underpinnings of International Law 91
- 5.7.1 *European Scholarship with “Sociological” Inspiration* 92
- 5.7.2 *American “Exceptionalism”* 94
- 5.7.3 *Singularities of the Soviet Doctrine (1922–1989)* 97
- 6 **Regional and National Traditions: Prolegomena to the Present (from the End of the Second World War to the 1970s)** 100
- 6.1 Introduction 100
- 6.2 Overview of Theories after the Second World War 101
- 6.2.1 *Europe* 101
- 6.2.2 *United States. Traditional, but also “What Seems Almost Evident [Is] the Difference between You and Me”* 119
- 6.2.3 *Latin America* 121
- 6.2.4 *Africa* 122
- 6.2.5 *Asia* 125
- 7 **Self-Referential International Law and the Compelling Need to Also Listen to Others’ Voices** 133
- 8 **Concluding Remarks** 137

PART 2

Enduring and New Schools, Movements and Trends

- 9 **Introduction** 141
- 10 **Basic Orientations** 145
- 10.1 The Liberal Agendas 145
- 10.2 The Positivist Stronghold 152
- 10.3 Renovated, Expressly Stated, Hidden or Inherited Naturalism 158
- 10.4 Realism 162

- 10.5 Idealism 169
- 10.6 Rationalism and Rationality 171
- 10.7 Pragmatism 175
- 10.8 Empiricism 178
- 10.9 Formalism 181

- II Other Approaches 184**
 - 11.1 Modernity, Modernism and Post-modernism 184
 - 11.2 Policy-Oriented Theory, Perspective or Jurisprudence 187
 - 11.3 Structuralism and Post-structuralism 190
 - 11.4 Constructivism 193
 - 11.5 Deconstruction 197
 - 11.6 Critical International Legal Studies 199
 - 11.7 Third World Approaches to International Law (TWAIL) 204
 - 11.8 The Feminist Presence 207
 - 11.9 Functionalism and Institutionalism 209
 - 11.9.1 *Functionalism* 209
 - 11.9.2 *Institutionalism in Its Double Sense* 212
 - 11.10 Instrumentalism 215
 - 11.11 International Regime Theories 217

- 12 Universal, Plural, Relative 220**
 - 12.1 Legal Cosmopolitanism 220
 - 12.2 Constitutionalism and the “Constitutionalization” of International Law 224
 - 12.3 Legal Pluralism 229
 - 12.4 Legal Relativism and Relativity 234
 - 12.5 Role Splitting 239

- 13 Further Explorations 241**
 - 13.1 Law and Economics or Rational Choice Approaches to International Law 241
 - 13.2 General Systems Theory (GST) or Systemic Theory (ST) 244
 - 13.3 A Place for Chaos Theory 251
 - 13.4 Current Marxist, Neo-Marxist and Leninist Approaches 254
 - 13.5 Moving in a “Middle Road” 256

- 14 Sociological Aspects of International Law Theories 258**

- 15 Concluding Remarks 261**

PART 3***Connecting More Writings to Theory*****SECTION 1*****The International Legal System: Important Issues***

- 16 Where is the International Community or Society? 267**
 - 16.1 Evolving Views 267
- 17 Ontological and Post-ontological Discourses 274**
 - 17.1 "International Law as Law" 274
 - 17.2 Mature or Primitive Law 280
 - 17.3 Discontent 281
 - 17.4 Law and Crisis 282
- 18 General (or Grand) Theories of International Law and General International Law 286**
 - 18.1 In Search of a Current Specimen of General Theory 286
 - 18.2 General International Law: The Parameters 288
- 19 Legal Basis of International Obligations 293**
- 20 Legitimacy 299**
- 21 Compliance 305**
- 22 Unity and Universality 312**
 - 22.1 Unity 312
 - 22.2 Universality 316
- 23 Fragmentation 323**
 - 23.1 Siblings of Fragmentation: Self-contained or Special Regimes 331
 - 23.2 Cohesion of Special Regimes or Subsystems 334
- 24 The Issue of Jurisdiction and Competence 336**
- 25 Fictions 340**
- 26 Hegemonic Power and Unilateralism 343**

- 27** The International Dimension of the Rule of Law 348
- 28** Normativity Forming an Integral Part of International Law 354
- 28.1 The Safe Port of Human Rights 354
- 28.2 Non-use and Use of Force 371
- 28.3 International Humanitarian Law (IHL) 394
- 28.4 The Economy: No More a Passing Silhouette 409
- 29** Concluding Remarks 423

SECTION 2

Flashes about the Addressees, the Fabrication and Operation of International Law

A

The Addressees of International Law

- 30** The “Users” of International Law: Moving beyond Doctrinal Controversies on “Subjects”, “Non-State Actors” and “Participants” 427
- 31** The State 434
- 31.1 The Concept 434
- 31.2 Creation and Recognition 435
- 31.3 Sovereignty 438
- 31.4 International Legal Personality 445
- 31.5 Equality 448
- 31.6 Territory 451
- 31.7 State Immunity/Immunities 453
- 31.8 Responsibility 459
- 31.9 Liability 470
- 31.10 Self-determination 473
- 31.11 Secession 476
- 31.12 Succession 481
- 31.13 Statehood and “One Size Fits All” Approaches 485
- 32** International Organizations 489
- 32.1 Role and Legal Status 489
- 32.2 Responsibility and Accountability of International Organizations. A Story of Loopholes 499

- 33 “Individuals” and Other Private Persons 511
 - 33.1 An Unfinished Symphony 511
 - 33.2 Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and the International Civil Society 517

B

Aspects of the Fabrication and Operation of International Law

- 34 Law-Making 525
 - 34.1 Producers 525
 - 34.2 Main Products and Modes of Fabrication 536
 - 34.2.1 Customary International Law 542
 - 34.2.2 Treaties 557
 - 34.2.3 General Principles of Law 568
- 35 Expanding the Products and Modes of Fabrication 575
 - 35.1 Soft Law 575
 - 35.2 Standards 580
 - 35.3 A Converging Category: Transnational Law 581
- 36 Relationship between Norms 584
 - 36.1 Hierarchy of Norms 584
 - 36.2 The Intertwined Duo of *Jus Cogens* and Obligations *Erga Omnes* 586
 - 36.2.1 *Jus Cogens* 587
 - 36.2.2 *Obligations Erga Omnes* 592
 - 36.3 Successive, Parallel and Contradictory Commitments. The Issue of Transtextuality 596
- 37 Interpretation 600
- 38 Concluding Remarks 614

SECTION 3

Widening the Discourse

- 39 Interrogations and Expectations 619
 - 39.1 Progress and “Progressive Development” 619
 - 39.2 Democracy 625

- 39.3 The Eternal Quest for Ethics and Morality 629
- 39.4 Fluctuations on Justice Stemming from International Law 637
- 39.5 Globalization 640
- 39.6 Governance and Global Administrative Law 643
- 39.7 International Law and Politics 648
- 39.8 International Environmental Law 653

- 40 A Skeleton Meeting of Minds 661
 - 40.1 Attempts for a Dialogue between International Law and International Relations (IR) Theories 661
 - 40.2 General Theories of Law and Political Science Touching on International Law 665
 - 40.2.1 *General Theories of Law* 666
 - 40.2.2 *Other Doctrines Addressing Questions Related to International Law* 673

- 41 Concluding Remarks 682

- 42 Final Conclusions: The Choristers' Performances 684

- Index of Authors 689
- Index of Subjects 702