

UBO 4560923

A Theory of the Executive Branch

Tension and Legality

MARGIT COHN

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
------------------------------	------

Introduction	1
--------------	---

PART I. PRELIMINARIES

1. Preliminaries	7
A. Introduction	7
B. 'The Executive Branch': A Preliminary Definition	8
C. The Executive Branch Researched: Common Themes and Debates	9
D. Constitutionalism and Internal Tensions	22
E. Answering Initial Challenges to General Theory	27
1. Comparing Parliamentary and Presidential Regimes?	27
2. 'Core' Executives and Administrative Agencies	31
F. Concluding Remarks	39
2. Reaching the Internal Tension Model	42
A. Introduction	42
B. Three Institutional Models Rejected	43
1. The Subservient Executive Model: The Separation of Powers and the Rule of Law	43
<i>a. The separation of powers</i>	43
<i>b. The rule of law</i>	45
2. The Imperial Executive Model	47
<i>a. Managerial theories</i>	47
<i>b. Exception-based theories</i>	49
3. The 'Bipolar' Model	53
C. The Internal Tension Model	55
D. Concluding Remarks	57
3. Maintaining the Internal Tension Model	59
A. Introduction	59
B. Conceptualizing Fuzziness I: Research Streams	60
1. Four Research Streams	60
<i>a. Delegation and discretion</i>	60
<i>b. 'Soft law'</i>	62
<i>c. 'Grey holes'</i>	64
<i>d. 'Fuzzy law'</i>	66
2. Moving Forward	68

C.	Conceptualizing Fuzziness II: Thirteen Forms of Fuzziness	69
1.	Fuzzy Legality: A Taxonomy	69
2.	Constitution-Generated Fuzzy Legality	71
a.	<i>Open-ended constitutional provisions</i>	72
b.	<i>Fuzzy powers under an unwritten constitution</i>	73
c.	<i>Non-textual, general constitutional doctrines</i>	75
3.	Statute-Generated Fuzzy Legality	78
a.	<i>Open-ended, interpretable provisions</i>	79
b.	<i>Grants of discretion</i>	80
c.	<i>Delegation</i>	82
d.	<i>'Patchwork' legislation</i>	85
e.	<i>Multiple and indeterminate decision-makers</i>	86
f.	<i>'Lopsided' statute</i>	89
4.	Executive-Generated Fuzzy Legality	91
a.	<i>Selective enforcement and creative compliance</i>	91
b.	<i>'Pastiche' law</i>	92
c.	<i>Extra-statutory parallel arrangements</i>	93
d.	<i>Multiple mixed source citation</i>	94
D.	Concluding Remarks	97

PART II. CONSTITUTION-GENERATED FUZZY LAW

4.	Unilateral, Non-Statutory Executive Powers	101
A.	Introduction	101
B.	Non-Statutory Powers: A Short Primer	106
C.	Bases of Authority	107
1.	Constitution-Based Direct Sources	107
a.	<i>An unwritten constitution: the UK</i>	108
b.	<i>A written constitution: the US</i>	112
2.	Constitution-Type Extra-Textual Doctrines	115
a.	<i>Political reality</i>	115
b.	<i>Sovereignty and nationhood</i>	116
c.	<i>Personification</i>	117
d.	<i>'Historical gloss'</i>	121
e.	<i>Aggregation of powers</i>	122
D.	Legal Constraints on Unilateral Non-Statutory Powers	123
1.	The Residuality Doctrine	123
2.	Subjection to Judicial Review	127
E.	Concluding Remarks	135
5.	The Nature and Use of Unilateral Executive Measures: A Comparative Analysis	137
A.	Introduction	137
B.	The Curious Case of Mixed-Authority Orders in Council, Executive Orders, and Others	139
1.	The United Kingdom: Orders in Council and Proclamations	139
a.	<i>The forms</i>	139

b. Fuzziness I: multiple and mixed authorities	141
c. Fuzziness II: the legal status of unilateral measures	145
d. Fuzziness III: access difficulties	146
e. Interim conclusion	149
2. The United States: Proclamations, Executive Orders, Memoranda, and Other Measures	149
a. The forms	150
b. Fuzziness I: multiple and mixed authorities	156
c. Fuzziness II: the legal status of unilateral measures	158
d. Fuzziness III: access difficulties	160
C. Comparative Analysis	161
D. Concluding Remarks	163

PART III. LEGISLATION AND EXECUTIVE-GENERATED FUZZY LAW

6. Case Studies: Emergency and Air Pollution, Overviews	167
A. Introduction	167
B. Emergency Law	169
1. General	169
2. Emergency Law in the UK	171
a. General	171
b. Layers of law pertaining to emergencies	173
(1) Customary international law	173
(2) Constitutional law	175
(3) International treaty law and UN measures	176
(4) EU law	177
(5) Domestic primary legislation	179
3. Emergency Law in the US	180
a. General	180
b. Layers of law pertaining to emergencies	181
(1) Constitutional law	181
(2) Customary international law	182
(3) International treaty law and UN measures	184
(4) Federal primary legislation	185
C. Air Pollution Law	186
1. General	186
2. Air Pollution Law in England	188
a. General	188
b. Layers of law pertaining to air pollution	189
(1) International law	189
(2) EU law	190
(3) Domestic primary legislation	192
3. Air Pollution Law in the US	194
a. General	194
b. Layers of law pertaining to air pollution	194

(1) <i>Constitutional law</i>	194
(2) <i>International and transnational law</i>	195
(3) <i>Federal primary legislation</i>	196
D. Concluding Remarks	197
7. Legislation-Generated Fuzziness: Patchwork Legislation	198
A. Introduction	198
B. Piling-up	199
1. General	199
2. Examples	200
a. <i>UK anti-terrorism law</i>	200
b. <i>UK Brexit legislation</i>	203
C. Dispersion	204
1. General	204
2. Examples	205
a. <i>US air pollution</i>	205
b. <i>US emergency law</i>	208
D. The Fuzzy Consequences of Patchworking	212
1. Redundancy/Complexity	212
2. Contradiction	216
3. Under-Funding/Denial of Funding	218
E. Concluding Remarks	222
8. Executive-Generated Fuzziness: On the Spectrum of (Non)-Implementation	223
A. Introduction	223
B. From Informal Enforcement to Creative Compliance	225
1. Informal Enforcement	226
a. <i>General</i>	226
b. <i>Example: EPA's Supplemental Environmental Projects (SEPs)</i>	228
2. Creative Compliance	232
a. <i>General</i>	232
b. <i>Examples</i>	233
(1) <i>EPA's first two decades</i>	233
(2) <i>Funding the US-Mexico wall</i>	235
C. 'Pastiche' Law	239
1. General	239
2. Examples	240
a. <i>Under- or never-implemented statutes</i>	240
b. <i>'Floating' statutes</i>	242
c. <i>Under-funded law</i>	247
D. Fuzzy Implementation: The Prices Paid	249
E. Concluding Remarks	251

PART IV. ANALYSIS

9. Fuzzy Legality and the Challenge to Proper Governance	255
A. Introduction	255
B. The Challenges of Fuzzy Legality to Proper Governance	256
1. Introduction	256
2. Arguments from Democratic Theory	257
a. <i>The rule of law discourse</i>	257
b. <i>Participatory/deliberative democratic theory</i>	262
3. The Benefits of Fuzzy Legality?	265
4. Summary	268
C. The Political Economy of Fuzzy Legality	269
1. Introduction	269
2. The Rise and Retention of Fuzziness: Mapping the Explanatory Factors	271
3. Endogenous Reasons for Fuzziness	272
4. Exogenous Reasons for Fuzziness	278
a. <i>Power-accumulation and retention</i>	279
b. <i>Disagreement</i>	282
(1) <i>During the design stage</i>	282
(2) <i>After introduction</i>	284
c. <i>Pressure to act</i>	285
d. <i>Marginalization</i>	285
D. Concluding Remarks	286
10. Keeping the Internal Tension Under Check: The Role of the Judiciary in a Multiple-Fora Participatory/Deliberative Democracy	289
A. Introduction	289
B. In Search of Normative Integrity	293
C. The Role of the Judiciary: A Critical Overview	295
D. Enhancing Judicial Review: Arguments from Democratic Theory	306
1. The Rule of Law	306
2. Participatory/Deliberative Democratic Theory	308
3. But Why the Courts?	312
E. Addressing Counter-Arguments	313
F. Concluding Remarks	319
Conclusion	321
<i>Index</i>	323