

The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

The Role of the Treaty on Treaties in Contemporary International Law

edited by

GIUSEPPE PASCALE and SARA TONOLO



Edizioni Scientifiche Italiane

Table of Contents

The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: An Introduction (GIUSEPPE PASCALE – SARA TONOLO)

1. The Importance of Treaties in the History of International Law, Regardless of the Absence of a Treaty on Treaties before 1969 1
2. From the Work of the International Law Commission (1949-1966) to the Adoption and Entry into Force of the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 4
3. Observations on the Centrality of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties in Contemporary International Law 8
4. The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and Interactions between Treaties and Soft Law within Today's Interstate Relations 11
5. Why This Book? 16

PART I

Regulating the Life of Treaties pursuant to the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: Open Issues

CHAPTER 1

The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and the Guide to Practice on Reservations to Treaties (CLAUDIA CANDELMO)

1. The International Law Commission and the Guide to Practice on Reservations to Treaties 21
2. The Object and Purpose Test: Still a Conundrum? 24
3. Assessing the Relevance of Acceptance and Objections to Reservations 27
4. Understanding Reservations to Provisions on Monitoring Mechanisms 32
5. Dealing with General Reservations 36
6. Reserving Non-Derogable Provisions 40
7. The Guide and the Consequences of Invalid Reservations 43
8. Concluding Remarks 47

CHAPTER 2

Article 26 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and the Supervision of Periodic State Reports by International Monitoring Bodies (ROBERTO VIRZO)

1. Introduction and Scope of the Work 49

2. Considerations on the Obligation under Article 26 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties to Perform International Treaties in Good Faith and on the Proliferation of International Committees and Groups of Experts Who Supervise Compliance with Multilateral Treaties	50
3. Examination of Selected Cases from the Practice of International Committees and Groups of Experts: <i>a</i>) Recommendations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child regarding LGBTI Children's Rights	55
4. Continued: <i>b</i>) Recommendations of the Evaluation Teams of the Group of States against Corruption on Confiscation Measures	60
5. Concluding Remarks	64

CHAPTER 3

The Unilateral Termination of Provisional Application of Treaties
(ELISA TINO)

1. Introduction	67
2. Unilateral Termination of Provisional Application of Treaties According to Article 25(2) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	71
3. Unilateral Termination of Provisional Application of Treaties in the International Law Commission's <i>Draft Guide to Provisional Application of Treaties</i> : Guideline no. 9	76
3.1. The Vague Formulation of Draft Guideline no. 9(3)	78
4. States' Positions Concerning Draft Guideline no. 9: Applicability <i>v</i> Inapplicability of Provisions in Section 3, Part V, of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties to the Case of Provisional Application of Treaties	81
5. Further Considerations about the Applicability of Provisions in Section 3, Part V, of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: Provisionally Applied Treaty <i>v</i> Agreement on the Provisional Application of the Treaty	83
5.1. Legal Nature of the Agreement on the Provisional Application of a Treaty	84
6. The Application of Rules on Withdrawal from Treaties Depending on the Form the Agreement on Provisional Application Takes	90
6.1. Provisional Application Agreed by the Treaty Itself	91
6.2. Provisional Application Agreed by a Separate Treaty	94
6.3. Provisional Application Agreed by Other Means	95
7. Conclusions	99

CHAPTER 4

Litigating Treaties by Means of Article 46 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (DIEGO MAURI)

1. Introduction: Theoretical Background of a Debated Provision	103
2. "Article 46 Arguments" in International Adjudication	107
2.1. The Case Law of Arbitral Tribunals	107
2.2. The Case Law of the International Court of Justice	111
3. "Article 46 Arguments" in Domestic Litigation	115
3.1. Treaties Regulating the Extradition or Transfer of Individuals	117
3.2. Human Rights Treaties	119
4. Wrap-Up of the Discussion and Concluding Remarks	124

CHAPTER 5

Comparing Suspension, National Security Exception, and Derogation Clauses in Light of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (LUIGI SAMMARTINO)

1. Introduction	129
2. A General Premise to Suspension of Treaties	130
3. Exception and Derogation Clauses for National Security Reasons	136
4. Effects of Suspension and Exception/Derogation Clauses: A Comparative Approach	142
4.1. Premises for Invocation	142
4.2. Consent v. Discretion	147
4.3. Suspension and Responsibility: The Inherent Value of Notifications	151
5. Concluding Remarks	155

CHAPTER 6

Escaping without an Exit Door? Some Remarks on Article 56 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties in Light of the Recent Practice (MARTINA BUSCEMI)

1. Introduction	157
2. Leaving the Door Open or Closed? Some Preliminary Remarks on the Inclusion of Withdrawal Clauses in Multilateral Treaties	159
3. Article 56 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and the Issues Left Open	162
4. A cursory insight on early practice subsequent to the adoption of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	166
5. Recent practice of withdrawal from treaties silent to this effect	171
6. Some final remarks on the actual relevance of Article 56 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: Between a 'Quick Divorce', Acquiescence, and the Principle of Good Faith	183

PART II

New Trends in Treaty Interpretation
and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

CHAPTER 7

The Interpretation of Uniform Law and Private International Law Conventions: What Role for the General Interpretation Rules under the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties? (FABRIZIO MARONGIU BUONAIUTI)

1. The Pursuit of an Autonomous Interpretation of Uniform Law and Private International Law Conventions	189
2. Special Rules Contained in These Conventions Concerning Their Interpretation and the Filling in of <i>Lacunae</i> Revealed in Their Application	192
3. The Insufficiency of a Reference to the General Principles Inherent in the	

Relevant Convention in Respect of Technical or Procedural Issues, and the Subsidiary Solution Consisting of a Reference to the Law Applicable Pursuant to Private International Law Rules	196
4. Relevance of the General Rules on Treaty Interpretation as Codified under the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties Absent Specific Rules Concerning Interpretation in the Convention Concerned, or for the Purposes of Integrating Such Rules	200
4.1. Relevance of the General Rule of Interpretation under Article 31 of the Vienna Convention, in Its Various Constituent Elements	201
4.2. Pertinence of the Rule under Article 32, Referring to Subsidiary Means of Interpretation, with Particular Regard to Preparatory Works	207
4.3. Suitability of the Solutions Conceived under Article 33, as Concerns Conventions Authenticated in Two or More Languages	208
5. Concluding Remarks	210

CHAPTER 8

The Interpretation of Treaties as Living Instruments (GIANFRANCO GABRIELE NUCERA)

1. Introduction	211
2. The Living Instrument Theory within Law-Making Treaties	215
3. The Living Instrument Theory within Operational Treaties	232
4. Is It Possible to Identify the Main Elements of the Living Instrument Theory?	235
5. The Outer Space Treaty as a Case Study: Beyond Any Formalistic Approach	236
5.1. The Constitutional Elements of the Outer Space Treaty	237
5.2. The Quasi-Institutional Elements of the Outer Space Treaty	240
6. Conclusions	244

CHAPTER 9

Some Remarks on the Role of Soft Law in Treaty Interpretation: 50 Years after the Adoption of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (DONATO GRECO)

1. Introduction	249
2. Soft Law and the International Rule of Law: A Love-Hate Relationship	251
3. The General Rule of Treaty Interpretation under Article 31 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	253
4. Literal Interpretation under Article 31(1) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: The Ordinary Meaning	255
5. Contextual Interpretation under Article 31(1) and (2)(a)(b) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: The Context	257
6. Teleological Interpretation under Article 31(1) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: The Object and Purpose	258
7. Authentic Interpretation under Article 31(3)(a)(b) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties: Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice	259
7.1. An Overview of International and Domestic Case Law	265
8. Systemic Integration under Article 31(3)(c) of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	274
9. Concluding Remarks	282

PART III

Current Problems on Consistency among Treaties
and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

CHAPTER 10

Testing the Memorandum of Understanding between Italy and Sudan against Anti-Trafficking Treaties: Issues of Incompatibility in Light of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (FRANCESCA TAMMONE)

- | | |
|---|-----|
| 1. Introduction | 287 |
| 2. The Memorandum of Understanding in the Context of the Outsourcing Migration Management | 289 |
| 3. Qualifying the Memorandum of Understanding between Italy and Sudan as a Treaty: A Pre-Condition | 293 |
| 4. The Migration-Human Trafficking Nexus and the Relevant International Sources | 296 |
| 4.1. Migration-related Obligations in the United Nation Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Trafficking Protocol | 300 |
| 5. The Incompatibility of the Memorandum between Italy and Sudan with Treaties against Human Trafficking | 302 |
| 6. Managing Incompatibility in Light of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties | 304 |
| 7. Conclusions | 307 |

CHAPTER 11

The Relationship between Intra-EU Investment Arbitration under the Energy Charter Treaty and the Lisbon Treaty in Light of Article 41 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (GIULIANA LAMPO)

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 1. Introduction | 313 |
| 2. The Applicability of EU Concerns on Investor-State Dispute Settlement Mechanisms to the Energy Charter Treaty | 319 |
| 3. The Relationship between Article 30 and Article 41 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties | 324 |
| 4. The Requirements of Article 41 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties | 328 |
| 5. Concluding Remarks | 336 |

CHAPTER 12

The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and the Compatibility between International Trade Agreements and Treaties on the Protection of Human Rights or the Environment (AZZURRA MUCCIONE)

- | | |
|-----------------|-----|
| 1. Introduction | 339 |
|-----------------|-----|

2. Cases and Hypothesis of Conflicts between Trade Agreements and Treaties on the Protection of Human Rights or the Environment	342
3. The Issue of Incompatibility between Trade Agreements and Other Treaties in the Light of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	347
4. The Existence of Exception Clauses in Trade Agreements as Elements Supporting the Compatibility	352
5. The Relevance of Other Treaties in the Interpretation of Trade Agreements	356
6. The <i>extrema ratio</i> : Treaties Amendments and Negotiations	362
7. The Recent Practice to Include Obligations on the Protection of Human Rights and the Environment in Trade Agreements: Is This a New Frontier in Terms of Compatibility?	368

CHAPTER 13

The Proliferation of Uniform Private International Law Regimes and the Issue of their Coordination in Light of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (ILARIA AQUIRONI)

1. Introductory Remarks	375
2. The Recent Contribution of the Hague Conference to the Development of Uniform Private International Law Regimes	377
3. The Plurality of Actors Involved in the Adoption of Uniform Private International Law Regimes	379
4. The Proliferation of Uniform Private International Law Regimes: Reasons and Needs	381
5. Strategies and Techniques Aiming at Ensuring Coordination among Uniform Private International Law Regimes	382
5.1. Conflict Prevention	383
5.2. Conflict Management	390
6. Conclusion	396

PART IV

Contemporary Perspectives on the Vienna Convention
on the Law of Treaties beyond Treaties

CHAPTER 14

The Application of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties to Unilateral Declarations of Acceptance of the Jurisdiction of International Courts and Tribunals (GABRIELE ASTA)

1. Introductory Remarks. Beyond the Theoretical Applicability of the Law of Treaties to Unilateral Declarations of Acceptance of the Jurisdiction of International Courts and Tribunals: Shifting the Focus on Its Current Application	401
2. Preliminary Observations on the Possibility to Consider the International Courts' Case Law in a Unitary Way	408
3. The Uneven Application of the Law of Treaties and of the 1969 Vienna Convention to the Withdrawal of Unilateral Declarations	414

4. The – Almost – Full Application to the Interpretation of Unilateral Declarations of the Method Codified in the Relevant Provisions of the 1969 Vienna Convention	423
5. The Regime Concerning the Admissibility of the Reservations Contained in Unilateral Declaration and the Law of Treaties	434
6. Concluding Observations. Difficulties in Systematising the Heterogeneous Modes of Application of the Law of Treaties	442

CHAPTER 15

The Applicability of Articles 31 and 32 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties to Security Council Resolutions (LAURA DI GIANFRANCESCO)

1. Introduction	445
2. The Interpretation of Security Council Resolutions in the Case Law of the International Court of Justice	447
3. Scholars' Position on the Interpretation of Security Council Resolutions	450
4. The Use of the Vienna Convention Method in the <i>Al Bashir</i> Case before the International Criminal Court	452
4.1. Background of the <i>Al Bashir</i> Case	454
4.2. The Restrictive Approach to the Interpretation of the Referral	457
4.3. The Appeals Chamber Decision of 6 May 2019	460
5. Some Reflections on the Suitability of the Vienna Convention Method for the Interpretation of Security Council Resolutions	463
6. Concluding Remarks	469

PART V

Recent Interactions between European Union Law and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

CHAPTER 16

The Court of Justice of the European Union and the Relevance of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties to International Agreements Concluded with Third Countries (STEFANO SALUZZO)

1. Introduction	473
2. The Applicability of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties to International Agreements Stipulated by the European Union	474
3. Uses and Misuses of the Rules of Interpretation Enshrined in the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	478
3.1. The Object and Purpose of International Agreements	478
3.2. Systemic Integration and the Misuse of the Interpretative Approach	481
4. Avoiding Issues on the Law of Treaties	485
5. Contributing to the... 'Development of International Law'	489
6. Conclusive remarks	492

CHAPTER 17

The Relationship between the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and Other Human Rights Treaties Binding on the EU Member States (NICOLE LAZZERINI – MONICA PARODI)

1. Introduction	495
2. The Relevance of Human Rights Treaties in the Case Law of the Court of Justice before the Legal Upgrading of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	498
3. The Provisions of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights Drawing Inspiration from Human Rights Treaties	500
4. The Role of the European Convention on Human Rights and of the Strasbourg Case Law in the Interpretation of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	503
4.1. The Formalization of the Special Significance of the European Convention on Human Rights under Article 52(3) of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	504
4.2. The Variable Geometry of the Court of Justice's Approach to the Strasbourg Case Law	506
5. The Relevance of Human Rights Treaties Other Than the European Convention on Human Rights	512
6. The Use of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights in the Interpretation of the European Convention on Human Rights by the Strasbourg Court	516
7. Concluding Remarks	521

CHAPTER 18

The EU Ancillary Treaties, the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, and the Institutional Transformation of the EU Legal Order (ROBERTO CISOTTA)

1. Background and Preliminary Points	523
2. The EU <i>Ancillary Treaties</i> in the Context of the Economic and Monetary Union	526
3. EU Founding and <i>Ancillary Treaties</i> and Their Relations in the Ambit of the Legal Framework of the Euro Area	533
4. An Unfinished Project: The Integration of the EU <i>Ancillary Treaties</i> Serving the Functioning of the Economic and Monetary Union into the EU Legal Order	538
5. Concluding Remarks: Paradoxes, Constitutional Guardians, Risky Ambiguities in the Framing of the <i>Recovery Plan</i> and the Difficult Way Ahead	541

CHAPTER 19

The Economic and Monetary Union, International Law, and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (GIOVANNI ZACCARONI)

1. Introduction	551
2. The Euro and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	553
3. The Eurogroup	556

4. The Greek Loan Facility, the European Financial Stability Facility and the European Financial Stabilization Mechanism	560
5. The European Stability Mechanism	562
5.1. How the European Stability Mechanism is Governed	563
5.2. Which Support is Available via the European Stability Mechanism?	564
6. Amending the European Stability Mechanism Treaty	567
6.1. Introducing a Common Backstop to the Single Resolution Fund	568
6.2. The Collective Action Clauses	568
6.3. The Amended European Stability Mechanism Treaty and the Debate over Conditionality	569
7. Conclusion	570
<i>Table of Authors</i>	573